

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Joanne Mahoney: Good afternoon, I am Joanne Mahoney, Chair of the New York State Thruway Authority Board of Directors. Welcome to the November 19, 2024, meeting. I am attending the meeting from the Thruway headquarters in Albany. I am joined by Board Members Bob Megna, Norman Jones, Dr. Veras, Heather Briccetti Mulligan, Paul Tokasz, and the New York State Thruway Authority Staff. Today we're going to start with the Finance Committee, Bob, you are Chair, also on the committee is Dr. Veras, and I am ex-officio. Would you please get us started? Thank you.

Bob Megna: The first item is the approval of the minutes. Any questions on the minutes if not, can I have a motion to move them?

Joanne Mahoney: So moved.

Jose Holguin Veras: Second.

Bob Megna: All in favor? Aye.

All: Aye.

Bob Megna: Any opposed? The motion is approved. The second item on the agenda is review and approval of the August and September 2024 financial reports, and Dave Malone will give an overview.

Dave Malone: Good afternoon. This item seeks the Committee's approval to advance to the full Board the monthly financial reports for August and September of 2024. Through September, passenger traffic was up 1.7% and commercial traffic was down 0.2%. As we talked about in the past meetings, we are well exceeding our original forecast which called for passenger traffic to be down about 1.5% and commercial traffic to be down about 4.8%. Total operating revenues through September were \$845 million consisting of \$826 million of tolls and related fees, \$14 million in lease revenues and \$5 million other miscellaneous revenues. This represents a year-to-date increase of \$168 million or 25% compared to 2023 driven primarily by the toll adjustments that took place on January 1<sup>st</sup> of this year. Specifically, passenger toll revenue increased by \$99 million or 29%, commercial toll revenue increased \$62 million or 23%. We also had nonoperating revenues of \$58 million through September consisting primarily of interest earned on investments. Revenues are 7% above our original 2020 budget has resulted in both those traffic levels and interest rates exceeding the original forecast, and during today's budget presentation, I will be going over with the committee the revisions we plan to make to our 2024 budget as a result of what we are seeing so far.

Switching to expenses, Thruway operating expenses through September were \$297,000,000, an increase of \$21 million or 8% compared to 2023. There are several reasons for the increase. Cashless tolling administrative costs which include credit card fees are up about \$4.5 million, some of that is related to the additional toll revenue that we're collecting, personal service costs increased

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

\$4.2 million, health insurance costs increased \$3.3 million. We have also had increases in highway and bridge maintenance costs, fiberoptic marketing fees related to some of the user agreements that we signed in 2024 as well as a small increase in pension costs. In comparison to our original 2024 budget, these operating costs are actually about 4% below budget. There are a couple of reasons for that. 2024 Personal Service costs were under budget by \$5.6 million, which is primarily attributable to staffing levels being below where we had planned, that's tied into difficulties we had with recruiting certain areas of the organization and certain titles of the organization, costs for fiberoptic maintenance fees and highway and bridge repair work are underbudget by about \$4.1 million which is primarily a timing issue. It's just a matter of what bills were paid in the second half of the year. Fuel and salt costs are about \$2.8 million under budget, it's been mild weather so far, third week in November in New York, but hopefully that stays as we go through the rest of the year. Although we are underbudget through September, I do believe by the time we get to the end of the year our operating costs will be close to the original budget that was put in place. And with that I can answer any questions the committee may have.

Bob Megna: More on revenue and less on costs, that's always what we want to hear. Any questions? If not, can I have a motion to advance this item?

Jose Holguin Veras: So moved.

Joanne Mahoney: Second.

Bob Megna: All in favor? Aye.

All: Aye.

Bob Megna: Any opposed? The motion is approved. The third item is approval of the Authority's investment transactions for the third quarter, and Dave will present again.

Dave Malone: This item seeks the Committee's approval to advance to the full board the investment report for the third quarter of 2024. Within your materials, exhibit A of this item details all the investments purchased during the third quarter and Exhibit B details the investments held as of the last day of the quarter. During the third quarter, we purchased \$2.55 billion in investments comprised of \$2.4 billion in Thruway Authority funds, \$124 million in state PIT revenue bond program funds, and \$26 million in trust fund bond program funds. As of the last day of the quarter, we held investments with a par value of \$1.39 billion, with a breakdown of \$1.35 billion in Thruway Authority Funds, \$13 million in state PIT revenue bond program funds, and \$31 million in trust fund bond program funds. During the quarter, our average yield on the Thruway Authority investments was 5% with a weighted average maturity of 46 days. That is about a 15 basis point decrease from the second quarter as a result of those interest rates starting to come down as we got into the third quarter of this year. With that I can answer any questions the Committee may have.

Bob Megna: I would just tell DOB if they're not going to use the money just keep it.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Dave Malone: I'll make that recommendation (laughing).

Bob Megna: So little at this point.

Joanne Mahoney: I'll make the motion to approve the financial plan.

Bob Megna: Second? All in favor aye.

All: Aye.

Bob Megna: Any opposed? The motion is approved. Number 4 is review and approval of the 2024 Revised Financial Plan, the 2025 budget Long-term Financial Plan, and 2025 to 2029 Capital Plan. That's a mouthful.

Dave Malone: Just need a little technical help. Just a little presentation to go through on our budget. This resolution seeks the Committee's approval to advance to the full board a revised 2024 financial plan and proposed 2025 budget and 5-year the 2025 to 2029 Capital Plan. Brent Howard and I, the Chief Engineer, are going to joint present this item. Talks not just about the financial plan but what this investment means for our infrastructure. The budget we are seeking approval for today is a balanced financial plan that provides the resources needed for the Thruway to remain one of the safest and most reliable highway systems in the world. Looking at this first slide, the proposed 2025 budget is a \$1.36 billion spending plan consisting of just under \$500 million for operations including both direct Thruway costs as well as reimbursement to the State of New York for Troop T costs, \$383 million for debt service and \$477 million for capital plan. It represents a \$77 million or 6% increase compared to our revised 2024 budget, with the increase being driven primarily by additional investments in our capital plan and an increase in debt service related to funding of that capital plan. One item to note on this slide, in 2024 we completed 2 bond transactions that generated present value savings related to refunding previously issued bonds, that savings in total was \$142 million. At first glance, when you look at this slide, you don't see savings, when you look at that debt service line, but if it wasn't for those two transactions, the \$383 million figure you see there would be \$11 million higher. So, I wanted to make the Board aware of that.

This next slide shows both the original and revised traffic forecast as well as the 2025 forecast, the most significant element of the budget regarding traffic is the upward revision of our 2024 forecast. The original forecast projected we would have 382.6 million total transactions in 2024, the revised forecast you see here prepared by our traffic engineer reflects what we will be seeing in those monthly financial reports we are going over in that we are going to now project we are going to end the year with 400.2 million toll transactions. It's a number revision of 17.6 million, over 4.6%. Two reasons for this; one is the original traffic report forecasted some level of negative economic activity to occur in the country, that hasn't happened in 2024. As well as a little bit more traffic diversion as a result of the toll adjustments, again, we've seen very little of that. Looking at 2025 in the yellow column, traffic next year is forecasted to be very close to 2024 levels a minor overall

## NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting November 19, 2024

increase of about 0.5% and no real discernible difference between passenger revenue, both looking to go up about 0.5%. Really, the critical assumption here is that this is built on is that our economy will remain relatively stable into 2025 and throughout 2025.

This next slide goes over revenues. Beginning with the original vs. revised 2024 figures. You can see the impact of the upward revision of those 2024 traffic projections. We are now forecasting we will end 2024 \$1.14 billion in revenues, it's \$51 million higher than originally budgeted with most of the increase tied to that upper traffic. Two other items to note regarding revisions to 2024, our forecast for interest earnings has been increased due to the interest rates remain elevated longer in 2024 than was originally anticipated.

Bob Megna: Just one quick, when you say original, original done by the Board or after we did revisions during the year?

Dave Malone: So that's the original that was done by the Board, it approved at this time last year November of 23, and then updates from there. And then there is also a revision to the other category, you can see it's going down from 11.8 to 6.6 and this is tied to both the timing and the amount of planned sales of surplus real property.

Moving to 2025, total revenues are forecasted to be \$1.16 billion, it's an increase of \$18.5 million or 1.6% compared to revised 2024 levels. Of the total \$1.16 billion, \$1.11 billion is from tolls and related fees, and the remaining \$42 million is from a combination of lease revenues, interest on investments, and other miscellaneous items. Tolls and related fees are forecasted to increase \$26.6 million or 2.4% next year that reflects the half percent increase in traffic that we talked about on the last slide, as well as additional revenue from a previously approved toll adjustment that will go into effect on January 1, 2025 for the Governor Mario M. Cuomo Bridge. That adjustment will increase the passenger rate of New York EZ-Pass customers using the bridge by 50 cents. The discount plans on the bridge for commuters as well as for residents of Rockland and Westchester Counties remain in place at the same percentage discounted off the standard New York EZ-Pass rates, so no change on the discount plans. Rates for other vehicle types using the bridge will increase by amounts proportionate to the 50-cent increase for passenger vehicles. Toll rates for the remainder of the Thruway system will not change in 2025. And all of our toll rates, including the rates that will go into effect on January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025, at the bridge are available on our website. One other item to note is the budget for interest earnings is \$9.7 million or 32.2% lower than the revised 2024 levels, taking into account the anticipation that action has already taken place on interest rates was anticipated to continue as we go into next year.

This next slide focuses on our budget for operating costs. Showing our amounts needed to directly operate the Thruway Authority as well as amounts needed to reimburse the State of New York for the Division of State Police Troop T costs. Beginning with 2024, the operating budget is being revised slightly upwards \$482.9 million to \$487.2 million. Higher costs than anticipated for health insurance, bridge inspection costs, and credit card fees are the primary drivers of this upward revision. Lower personal service costs resulted from staffing being below planned levels are

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

partially off setting those increases as you can see here. Looking at 2025, in the yellow column, the proposed operating budget totals \$499.8 million for next year, it is an increase of \$12.6 million or 2.6%. Personal service costs are anticipated to increase \$7.7 million or 5.4%, and that increase is being driven primarily by cost-of-living adjustments previously approved in 2025 within our negotiated labor agreements. Employee benefit costs are anticipated to increase \$11.1 million or 11.6% compared to the revised 2024 levels. There is a significant increase this year a \$6 million increase in pension contributions triggered by higher employer contribution rates established by the retirement system, about a \$5 million increase in health insurance cost based on the state of rate increases established by Civil Service through the New York State Health Insurance Program.

Joanne Mahoney: Interesting that the revised 2024 budget personal services number goes down so much and these benefit numbers still went up in the revised. I'm sure having to do with what you just described even with the \$7 million.

Dave Malone: Yeah, benefit side the health insurance rates have been increasing routinely over the last 4 years.

Joanne Mahoney: Even if you don't spend all the money on salaries, you still have the...

Bob Megna: You needed to do that to get to the 499.8 instead of rounding it up to 500.

Dave Malone: Yes, the cashless tolling administrative costs are anticipated to decrease \$14.1 million or 16.9% nonrecurring costs associated with, I would start by saying that the cost for the implementation of back office system that we're talking about are factored into the revised 2024 budget, so that's why you see a higher number there, and then a lower number as we go into 2025. Also, there are newer agreements we have with third party vendors to administer EZ-Pass and Toll by Mails have more favorable pricing terms than previous agreements, and you are going to see that we are going to start taking advantage of those more favorable pricing terms as we get into next year. So, those are the two items driving that decrease.

Looking at maintenance and repairs, the increase of \$3.2 million that's attributable to anticipated higher costs for highway and bridge repairs, as well as for fuel and auto parts. And then the last piece, the other category which did increase \$4.4 million is tied to fiberoptic marketing fees, again expectation that we're going to sign more user agreements next year at the one-time cost associated with the fees to put those user agreements in place. But ultimately, that generates additional revenue for the organization.

Bob Megna: I know I've asked this in the past, but have you noticed the inflation rates coming down or have things stayed about the same? I guess, for both of you, you deal with this all the time.

## NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting November 19, 2024

Dave Malone: I think there's been a leveling out, I would look to Andy too from a procurement standpoint, we've seen it. But I think there has been a leveling out, but clearly there was a period in time when it was significant in the last couple of years.

Dave Malone: This next slide focuses on our capital plan. The plan authorizes \$477.3 million in capital spending next year and commits \$2.67 billion to be invested in infrastructure and equipment over the next 5 years. This is an increased 5-year commitment of \$742 million or 38% since the approval of multiyear toll adjustment plan that went into effect at the beginning of 2024. Included in the \$2.67 billion, commitment is \$2.1 billion for capital contracts program, \$222 million which represents the unspent balance of the original New York Bridge project budget, \$239 million for equipment and systems, and \$104 million for the Thruway staff working on our capital projects. With that I'm going to turn it over to Brent Howard Chief Engineer to talk a little bit about what these investments are going to do for our infrastructure.

Brent Howard: Alright, thank you, Dave. Good afternoon, everybody. As Dave said, I'm going to talk briefly about what this investment in the 5-year capital contracts program means for our system. So, on the highway side over the next 5 years, this plan invests nearly \$1.2 billion in our pavement services. With these funds, we will be treating nearly 1,500 lane miles of our system either through rehabilitation or reconstruction. This represents approximately 61% of our total pavement which will be treated during those 5 years. On the bridge side, we will be investing about \$710 million over the next 5 years. This enables us to replace or rehabilitate 159 bridges, which represents about 20% of our 817 bridges on the system. While not on the slide here, I do want to mention that we will also be investing about \$150 million over the next 5 years in our facilities. We have 24 facility projects in the program which includes things like operating utilities, rehabilitation of wastewater treatment plants, salt shed replacements, and in building renovations and replacements, as well as some zero-emission vehicle infrastructure.

And just to highlight some of the larger projects that we have going on as part of this program, I'm going to hit on one in each division here. Buffalo division, we have a \$75 million contract to perform steel repairs and seismic upgrades on the South Grand Island bridges. And of note, on this one, this project takes advantage of a one-time federal grant in the amount of \$39 million. Syracuse division, we have \$61.5 million contract for a major rehabilitation of the roadway pavement between Canandaigua and Rochester. Albany division we're continuing with the second half of a rehabilitation of the Castleton Bridge this \$38.2 million also makes use of a one-time federal grant in the amount of \$21 million. And then the New York division, we have a rehabilitation of about 4 miles of I-95 New England Thruway in the amount of \$86.6 million.

Joanne Mahoney: I'm sorry, four miles?

Brent Howard: Four miles.

Joanne Mahoney: Wow.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Brent Howard: Yes, it's a major rehabilitation thicker than usual amount of asphalt over concrete repairs as well as increasing the bridge clearances and things like that. There are also a couple of bridge rehabilitations thrown in there as well, but I-95 is pretty pricey.

Joanne Mahoney: Compare that to the miles that you're doing in that Syracuse division.

Brent Howard: Yep, similar type treatment actually on that one as well, but a few less miles. Alright, and then as you can see in the projects I just mentioned, the Thruway has had some success in the past few years in obtaining federal grant money. I just want to mention that we continue to look for and apply for applications for new grant opportunities, which obviously will allow us to maximize our investment in the future. With that, if there are no further questions, I'll turn it back over to Dave.

Jose Holguin Veras: What are the expectations of DOT, USDOT to mundane some of these products?

Brent Howard: I don't believe we have a lot of clarity on that at this time. At the moment we have some applications in that we anticipate are not going to change, but we're keeping an eye on the situations as far as whether or not the opportunities are going to continue or not. At this point though, like I said, we don't have a firm grasp on what that looks like.

Joanne Mahoney: Yeah, I think that's fantastic, and all the work that went into going across the state and making a case for the toll increase is now paying off in this capital plan, and it means a lot of work for the Thruway staff, so, very grateful for that. It's easy for us to do this part, but you'll leave the road in better shape than you found it. That's fantastic.

Dave Malone: So, there's a couple of other initiatives, investments that we wanted to mention that go beyond that traditional highway and bridge investments, beginning with work zone safety, the 2025 budget invests \$4.1 million in equipment and other initiatives aimed at improving worker safety. These investments include purchases of impact attenuators, arrow board trailers, keep back signs, and other safety supplies. Included in this investment are funds collected from the Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement Program that began in 2023. Excess funds collected through that program are required by legislation to be invested back into worker safety initiatives. Some of the suggestions on ways to spend that money that have come through a taskforce that we felt here are shown on this slide.

Joanne Mahoney: Should we be acknowledging the terrible accident that happened at the last board meeting?

Frank Hoare: I was going to include it in my report to the Board.

Dave Malone: The plan also invests in new customer service improvements including new back-office system website, mobile app, and other improvements for New York EZ-Pass and Toll by

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Mail customers. When that system goes live, some of the improvements customers will see include more payment options, new website, mobile app, as well as improvements to security within the system. Also included in the plan is \$45 million for new radio system to replace the existing system which is 25 years old and functionally obsolete. That project will result in a reliable communication system for everyone involved in operating the Thruway including the Statewide Operation Center, First Responders, State Police, as well as our maintenance staff. As part of the project, we are either going to upgrade or build 50 tower sites. There is an ancillary benefit to that which is there is going to be some excess capacity on some of those new towers that will be an additional revenue source once they are up and operational. The project to redevelop our service area using a public/private partnership is nearing completion. Of the 27 locations, 24 are complete with the remaining 3 having planned opening dates in 2025. As we talked about, no toll or tax dollars have been used in this construction, and really the key there is that it's allowed us to focus our own capital funds on the core infrastructure investments. And another important part of this project has been the build out the EV charging infrastructure for passenger vehicles across the system. As of today, we have 75 level 3 charging stations operational at the service areas, welcome centers, commuter lots, and other locations, and we're looking for that number to increase up to about 130 charging stations once the service area redevelopment project is complete next year. As you can see, that basically creates end to end across the system of charging access on an average every 30 miles.

Jose Holguin Veras: What does the level of utilization of these chargers? The level of utilization, say hours of charging, number of vehicles, are they...

Dave Malone: That's a great question, I don't know the answer right off the top of my head. I don't know if anybody else does.

Frank Hoare: We have data that we can get. The reality is that less than 2% of registered vehicles in the state of New York at this point are electric vehicles, so we are more than meeting the capacity and the need. However, we know that that is going to increase in the future, and hence our plans to increase our capacity going forward, not just of passenger vehicles, but commercial vehicles as well is on the horizon, so.

Jose Veras: Thanks.

Dave Malone: And that's it for the presentation. Happy to answer any questions you have on the budget.

Bob Megna: Any questions for Dave? Further discussion? If note, can I have a move to advance the item?

Jose Holguin Veras: So moved.

Joanne Mahoney: And I'll second.



NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Bob Megna: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Bob Megna: Any opposed? The motion is approved. Is there any other business that the Finance Committee needs to take care of? If not, I will move to adjourn there being no further business. Can I have a motion to adjourn today's meeting?

Dr. Veras: So moved.

Joanne: Second.

Bob Megna: All in favor? Aye.

All: Aye.

Bob Megna: The Finance Committee is adjourned.

Joanne Mahoney: Thank you, very much. Next up is the Audit Committee which is chaired by Dr. Veras, also serving on the Committee is Heather Briccetti Mulligan, Joan McDonald who is not with us today, and I serve ex-officio, so, Dr. Veras will you please convene the meeting of the Audit Committee?

Dr. Veras: Thank you, Chair Mahoney. The first item is the approval of the minutes of the Audit Committee No. 63, may I have a motion to advance?

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: I will move.

Joanne Mahoney: Second.

Dr. Veras: Any discussion? All I favor?

All: Aye.

Dr. Veras: Any opposed? The motion is approved. The next item on the agenda is the review and approval of the BST's audit plan for the fiscal year ending December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2024. Dave Malone.

Dave Malone: This item seeks the Committees acceptance of the audit plan of our independent auditors BST and company for the fiscal year ending December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2024. Jonathan Gibbs, who I think you met at the September meeting, is here with us today. He is the partner with the audit company and is going to give you an overview of their audit plan.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Jonathan Gibbs: Thanks for having me today, folks. Very excited to continue our relationship with the Authority. You folks can remember my colleague Brennan Kennedy, he was previously the partner in according with Authority's Budget office part of the requirements rotation, he is now no longer part of their engagement team, I am delighted to be the partner and leading the engagement team this year. I want to give a quick scope of our services of what we plan on doing as well as our engagement team, our audit approach, the required communications, and independent considerations that we have. And ultimately answering any questions you have. You have engaged us to audit the Authority's financial statements, we will issue our audit opinion in accordance with general accepted accounting principles in the United State of America. We will also be issuing a report that's required under Government Auditing Standards in additional to a communications letter that is addressed to you folks on the Board that provides detail of how the actual audit went; whether we had disagreements with management, audit adjustments, significant difficulties requiring engagement, as well as if we agree with management's estimates as they prepared their financial statements themselves. We also, from time to time historically in most years, we petitioned a single audit report in accordance with the federal government requirements, if the Authority spends over \$750,000 each year performing audit to ensure compliance with those federal funding similar to what Dave talked about the \$21 million one-time grant that you're set to receive as you operate the system that would fall under the scope of our federal audit. Our engagement team includes a robust number of us at BST in accordance with our contract with the Authority, we also have a subcontractor for WMBE requirements of Catavax PA's. They provided those services for us historically, built up a great relationship with those folks as well. I just wanted to discuss briefly the responsibilities of management in addition to the responsibilities of BST. Management is responsible for the preparation of the financial statements as well as internal controls to ensure that there are no significant deficiencies or material weaknesses within the financial statements or transaction cycles thereto. They are also responsible for providing us with access to the information we need to perform the audit, and also report distribution according to the reports. Our responsibilities are to finish our compliance with generally accepted auditing standards as well as to perform the audit in accordance with our professional standards that we obtained an appropriate level of audit evidence in order to issue our opinion. We have quite a few key areas of focus. We determine materiality at the beginning of the audit engagement and then perform procedures over all material line items of the Authority's financial statements from the balance sheet of your investments to the liability such as pension, your OPED, all the way through the income statement of the Authority of your revenues and expenses. We perform procedures over each line items to gain that appropriate audit balance.

I would like to talk briefly about any significant accounting standards that will be impacting the Authority. There is one this year called GASDY 101 compensated absences. This is the government and county standards boards that requires a quick clarification as to defining a compensated absence. We talked about this management of it last year, ultimately, we don't think it's going to be applicable or change much about the Authority's reporting at all. Of course, that final determination comes of course, with the audit.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

We are required to consider fraud throughout the course of the engagement. While the audit is not designed to identify all fraud, should any fraud come to our attention, you folks that sit on the Audit Committee would certainly be notified in a timely manner on that. In light of that, through the communication throughout the audit process should anything else significant come to our attention, again, you folks that sit as Board Members would be brought into the loop. We are also required to remain independent. We have robust procedures to ensure that we are a third party that is entirely independent of the Authority. From engagement team members and their attesting that they have no significant independence appearance all the way through the firm's internal controls to ensure compliance with our professional standards. Again, we remain independent. Our timing is typical, similar to prior years in a sense that we'll begin our claim process here shortly. We will have field work in February of 2025, and ultimately, we will be issuing our reports by March 31<sup>st</sup> deadline that the Authority's Budget office requires us to complete the audit and have a report submitted and filed by then.

With that I would be happy to take any questions you folks would have.

Jose Holguin Veras: Any discussion? May I have a motion to advance this item?

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: So moved.

Joanne Mahoney: Second.

Jose Holguin Veras: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Jose Holguin Veras: Any opposed? The motion is approved. The last time is the 2025 internal audit plan and projects. Mary Boehm will present.

Mary Boehm: Thank you. Good afternoon, on behalf of the Department of Audit and Management Services I would formally like to submit our audit plan and project for the year 2025. If you have any questions, I would be happy to answer them.

Jose Holguin Veras: Any discussion? May I have a motion to advance this item?

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: So moved.

Joanne Mahoney: Second.

Jose Holguin Veras: All in favor?

All: Aye

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Jose Holguin Veras: Any opposed? The motion is approved. Is there any other business for discussion? There being no other business, may I have a motion to adjourn today's meeting of the Audit Committee?

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: So moved.

Joanne Mahoney: Second.

Jose Holguin Veras: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Jose Holguin Veras: That concludes the business of the Audit Committee, the meeting is adjourned.

Joanne Mahoney: Thank you, Dr. Veras. At this time, I would like to call to order the Board Meeting of the Thruway Authority #765. This scheduled meeting has been duly noticed as required by the Open Meetings Law. May I please have a motion to enter our Board Meeting please?

Bob Megna: So moved

Jose Holguin Veras: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: We are now in the full meeting of the Board. Our first order of business is the public comment period, speakers can address items on today's agenda, each speaker is limited to 2 minutes. Julie, has anyone signed up to provide in person comments or sent in written comments regarding today's agenda items?

Julie Greco: No.

Joanne Mahoney: This concludes the public comment period on today's agenda. And the next order of business is the approval of the consent agenda which is items 1-4. May I please have a motion to approve those?

Bob Megna: So moved.

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: Second.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: Any opposition? Hearing none the four board items and resolutions are approved. And we will move onto the action agenda. The appointment of Michelle McHale as Assistant Board Secretary. I will present the first action item to appoint Michelle as Assistant Board Secretary. The by-laws indicate that this position will serve as a backup to the Board Secretary as is needed. Michelle McHale has both public and private sector experience providing administrative support for legal offices. She joins the Thruway after serving in the Office of Counsel to the Governor where she supported the work of 16 assistant counsel. Prior to that, she worked in the appellate division, third department attorney grievances committee where she provided personal and confidential secretarial services to 3 principal attorneys, Chief Attorney, and Deputy Chief Attorney. During her time in the private sector, she provided administrative support at a number of firms in the legal and financial industry. In her short tenure here at the Thruway, Michelle has already contributed greatly by taking on tasks that require strong organizational skills and innovative approaches. And with that, I ask the Board for the approval of Michelle as the Assistant Board Secretary. Any discussion?

Norman Jones: Where is she?

Joanne Mahoney: Sounds like we are in good hands. Alright, if there's no discussion, may I have a motion to approve?

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: I will move.

Norman Jones: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: Hearing no opposition the motion is approved. Congratulations. The Executive Director will present the next item please.

Frank Hoare: Thank you, Chair, members of the Board it's my honor to introduce a recommendation to employment of our new Chief of Maintenance and Operations. Let me just acknowledge again that Jim Konstalid who held the position for several years retired in July. He was a legend around here and rose up and joined the Thruway very young through the ranks, and ultimately becoming the head of operations and maintenance. So, he retired in July, we have heard from him time to time, he is doing well. And he left big shoes to fill, but fortunately, we have someone as a public servant with vast public and private sector experience. Great skill, great judgment, and we're fortunate to have him join us here at the Board. Kevin Wisely known to

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

many of you. He started his public service as a fireman in Onondaga County and served at the Onondaga County Executive's Office. I had the honor of working with him in 2015 and 16 at DHSES where he served as Director of the Office of Emergency Management, and I was the General Counsel, and his last assignment has been at the Public Service Commission. So, again, I recommend to you his appointment as the Chief of Maintenance and Operations. He already hit the ground running, joining us last month, and he is well into it as we begin snow and ice season. Just also one note before I submit it for your consideration, thanks to Andy Nagy and the 4 Division Directors who always perform before but rose and warmed exceptionally in the interim between Jim leaving and Kevin coming up. So, I am thankful to them for doing that work. So, now I submit to you Kevin Wisely to be Chief of Maintenance and Operations.

Joanne Mahoney: Excellent. Is there any discussion? I would be happy to make the motion to approve and I will say that having had the experience to work personally with Kevin, I'm just absolutely thrilled for the Authority that you have this talent as part of your team, we had a really good team in Onondaga County government, Andy sitting next to him, Gordon Cuffey you might remember right? There has been a real pipeline from the Onondaga County to the Thruway Authority. But I just personally, whenever there was any kind of emergency or issue, if Kevin was on the scene, we knew we were in good hands, and I wish all of you the best because you have a really wonderful team member, so with that I'd like to make the motion to approve Kevin.

Bob Megna: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: Congratulations. Agenda item #7 will be presented by Selica Grant.

Selica Grant: Thank you, Madam Chair, Board Members, good afternoon. My item is to request authorization for the Executive Director for execute a contract with Davis Vision to provide vision care services for approximately 1,800 NYSTA employees and their families. The cost will be about \$1,797,568.15 over a five-year period. Annually, that averages to be about \$359,514.00. The contract will begin on March 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025. And I'm happy to answer any questions.

Paul Tokasz: That's a great approximate number.

Joanne Mahoney: Does anybody have any questions for Selica? Alright, may I have a motion?

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: I'll do it.

Jose Holguin Veras: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: Hearing no opposition, the motion is approved. And Diana, please take agenda item #8 for us.

Diana: Good afternoon, this item authorizes the Executive Director to eliminate the Carpool Plan at the Governor Mario M. Cuomo Bridge. We are now, several years into cashless tolling of more than 1.5 billion transactions successfully processed. We have reaped the benefits of cashless tolling from an environmental perspective, in that there is less air pollution resulting from nonstop travel, and vehicles idling at toll plazas waiting to pay. With this experience under our belts, we did analyze our processes and customer service discount programs and are streamlining and improving the customer service experience wherever possible. Looking back in 2008, the Board adopted a toll adjustment proposal including certain EZ-Pass discount programs. One being the Tappan Zee Bridge carpool commuter plan. In 2016, when the old Tappan Zee Bridge went cashless, the decision was made to discontinue the carpool plan for new customers while the Authority allowed existing carpool customers to keep that plan. Today, to further streamline our processes, I'm seeking to fully eliminate this plan. To put this into context, it will impact approximately 1,658 accounts which represent just half of 1% of NYSTA's total EZ-Pass accounts. In addition, both the MTA and the Port Authority discontinued their respective carpool plans when they went cashless and that impacted nearly 400,000 accounts. To minimize the impact on our customers, my staff have undertaken an analysis to determine whether these customers would be eligible for other discount plans, and as expected, the vast majority or about 82% are. 45% would be eligible for the Governor Mario M. Cuomo Bridge commuter plan, and approximately 37% would be eligible for the resident discount plan meaning that these customers reside in either Westchester or Rockland counties. This move better reflects travel patterns in 2024, in a post COVID world, it mitigates any potential misuse, and it continues our work to enhance cashless tolling for our customers. This will also result in approximately \$1 million in additional revenue to the Authority annually. I would be happy to answer any questions you may have.

Joanne Mahoney: Any questions? I would say that I appreciate that you've taken the extra step of mitigating the effort on any of the remaining accounts, and with that, can I have a motion please?

Bob Megna: So moved.

Jose Holguin Veras: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: The motion is approved. Kevin, the floor is yours.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Kevin Wisely: Good afternoon, Chairperson Mahoney and fellow Board members. It's an honor to be appointed to this position as Chief Maintenance and Operations Officer and also presenting my very first resolution, so thank you for your approval so I can do this. The resolution before you seek Board authorization for the Executive Director to enter into an agreement with Accredited Safety Solutions, Incorporated for required training and certification of our crane operators across the Thruway. The Authority is required by the Occupational Safety Health Administration OSHA and New York State's Department of Public Employees Safety Health Bureau PESH. Crane operators are certified through testing to ensure they are competent to do the operation of the cranes used by the Authority. Back on 18 June of this year, the Authority issued an RFP for the training certification of crane operators. They received 3 responses to the RFP. The proposals were reviewed and independently scored by an internal evaluation committee, and Accredited Safety Solutions, Incorporated was found to be fully responsive. The contract will cover a 3-year period with the option to review for two 1-year periods. The cost is not to exceed \$438,471. Thank you. Any questions?

Joanne Mahoney: I wish we all planned ahead to vote no, just to (everyone laughing). Thank you very much, Kevin. Is there any discussion? Alright, may I please have a motion to approve?

Bob Megna: So moved.

Jose Holguin Veras: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: The motion is approved. Thank you, Kevin, and I will now turn it over to Brent Howard for items 10 and 11 please.

Brent Howard: Good afternoon again. My first item #10 requests additional funding for the Biennial Bridge Inspection Contract of the Governor Mario M. Cuomo Bridge in the New York Division. Additional funds are needed due to additional inspection requirements that were not anticipated at the time of the contract, when it was originally awarded. This includes ongoing special inspections associated with anchor pipe rehabilitation project as well as mandated inspections of certain portions of the bridge at an annual interval. The original amount of this agreement was \$2.5 million, this request is to add an additional \$2.5 million bringing the maximum amount payable to \$5 million. Authorization and funding are available in the new New York Bridge Project account. And if you have any questions, I'd be happy to answer them.

Joanne Mahoney: Is there any discussion, questions? Let's have a motion first. All in favor?

All: Aye.



NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Joanne Mahoney: Thank you. Brent.

Brent Howard: Alright, my second item requests additional funding for the Biennial Bridge Inspection agreement for New York and Albany divisions. Additional funds are needed for several reasons including an escalating cost of work zone traffic control that is required as part of this project, additionally more work zone traffic control setups due to higher traffic volumes on the road have been required than was originally anticipated. The consultant has also been providing staffing support for both New York and Albany divisions due to challenges hiring in-house engineering staff, and also staff on long-term leave, and similarly, the consultant has also been conducting load rating analysis for our in-house bridges in both New York and Albany divisions, again, due to engineering staff vacancies. The original amount of this agreement was \$6.3 million, this request is to add an additional \$2 million, bringing the maximum amount payable to \$8.3 million. Funding is available in 24 and 25 from budget savings, project deferrals and carryover savings and property closeouts. Any questions?

Joanne Mahoney: Hearing none, I ask for a motion.

Bob Megna: So moved.

Jose Holguin Veras: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: The motion is approved. Thank you very much. And that brings us to the part of our agenda where we will have a couple of reports to the Board, and we'll start with you Andy Trombley please.

Andy Trombley: Thank you, good afternoon, Chair Mahoney, members of the Authority Board, it's always an honor to be here with you today. I'm here to present the attached report on procurement contracts and other agreements up to \$500,000 executed by the Executive Director during the period of July 1, 2024, through September 30, 2024. You can see in the attached exhibit 1 that there were 2 professional services contracts extended in the third quarter, and 1 contract assignment. Thank you for the opportunity to be here today, I'll answer any questions you may have.

Joanne Mahoney: Any questions on the procurement? I guess we don't have to approve, but any questions or discussions? Alright, thank you very much. And Frank the floor is yours.

Frank Hoare: Thank you, Chair. Again, it is sad to report this month since our last meeting, we had our second tragedy of the year. Our 15-year employee of the Thruway Authority Stephen Ebling was struck and killed by a vehicle in the Buffalo Division, and again, in a senseless way,

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

appears to be a distracted driver driving into the left shoulder and struck Stephen as he was parked and standing outside his vehicle in the left shoulder, again performing his duties. I won't say anymore, there are obviously a number of investigations going on relating to that. But Stephen leaves a wife Belindie, two sons, Brett and Joel. Again, just a tragic and senseless accident. Nothing can bring him back. We are working with our staff out there to make sure they have the, that his coworkers have the assistance they need to deal with this. It is, as I said, the second accident this year, we are looking at safety as our highest priority, we talk about it every day here, it is, I feel the most important thing I can do as Executive Director, and that the staff here the Executive Staff can do, and we are in constant discussion on that here at the staff level. Kevin brings a particularly deep background in that and already started working on that as well as Selica in administrative services and her team, it's really a whole team effort on that as well as, of course, our 4 Division Directors. We are in constant touch with each other in terms of what can we do to make the work zone safer. What these tragedies show is that there is no routine task, there is no casual day, at any time that our folks go out there, it is a highly dangerous dangerous environment that they are in and it's a different environment. Kevin and I have been talking about this, it's a different environment than it was in the past. We're going to have to respond to that. There is more distracted driving, more discourteous driving, if you want to call it that, you know when it doesn't seem an appropriate word when lives are lost, and employees have life changing injuries as we had in May. So, we are constantly look at that. Our automated work zone program that went into effect in May, I reported on this in the past, but again, just to highlight the numbers, between mid May when the program was initiated to mid October we have issued over 200,000 violations, and that's in 10 work sites, just in 10 work sites a week. Right, 200,000. Of those numbers 354 had three or more violations. I sent a letter in October to those 354, again, I don't have enforcement teeth on that, but an effort maybe to shame them, and to make them consider what they're doing, to slow down and pay attention. We are also working with Enterprise car rental and meeting with them. They had somewhat like 3,000 of their customers and they have been very cooperative and eager to work with us and come up with a solution and put something in that packet that you get when you rent a car, again, reminding them of these work zones, and the laws in general to pay attention to. We're trying every effort that we can. I have also written a letter to major trucking companies asking them again, to be mindful as we enter snow and ice season, it becomes particularly hazardous to our folks, and asking them to enforce and drive home that safety message to their drivers, and not just pay attention and slow down, pay attention to the law, but also things like when we close the road during snowstorms. It is so disturbing that you sit there during a snowstorm and you see the roads have been closed, the Governor has decided to issue an emergency declaration to safeguard people, not to inconvenience them but to safeguard people, not only the traveling public but our workers, the DOT workers, first responders, and yet you see, we'll sit in the operation center and see trucks just blow through a work zone, I'm sorry a zone that's been closed. So, we've written to the major trucking companies, again to highlight this issue again, public attention I think is what we need to do just as one tool in this. We are working more diligently and cooperatively and collaboratively with the State Police on this. They are great partners with us. Last month, in a related topic, our bridge hits that I have reported on in the past, we've been plagued by those, which not only cause infrastructure damage, that is quite expensive and quite an impact on our capital program and our maintenance programs, but it's a safety issue

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

to traveling public when a bridge gets hit. Last month, we did four sites with the State Police where we set up a detour and moved traffic off into a text area or turnaround lot, and we stopped vehicles for a period of time, 3 days in a row, and State Police issued hundreds of violations in regards to vehicles that are either over height or had some other violation, and what's interesting is the first day of those actions, is when we get the most violations written. By day 3, the word has gotten out to the community, and if they're over height or have some other unsafe act, they are getting off and detouring, which is what they're supposed to do, right. Again, so we're asking people to just adhere to the law. So, we're working with State Police, we're working with the trucking association, we have great partners as well in an effort to address this problem of over height vehicles, and trucks that are just, they're not driven safely. Finally, we are using technology, as technology emerges, we're using that to detect over height vehicles. We're using it to make our work zones safer. I alluded to it before, I think in a financial review, we are using funds with our safety program as generated by the fines from that program and pouring that into safety programs. So, it's always appropriate to talk about safety and again, it was a sad day, a tough year with 2 fatalities, and again, 1 life changing injury. We are looking at that, constantly looking at how we can decrease the risk out there. We are never going to eliminate the risk in a high-risk occupation, but what we can do to decrease the risk as much as possible. But ultimately, right, we need the public to do their job, right. Also, looking at legislation and working with the Governor who has made this a high priority. We will be looking at legislation this session to put added teeth in the laws again, hopefully as an incentive to follow the law. Tragically when our employee Vinny was killed in May, the driver of that was charged in a county court, his penalty was \$750.00, a driving safety course, and a 6-month suspension. And as his wife noted, the suspension will be over before the first-year anniversary of the accident. So, we have attentive and eager partners in the legislature, Chairman Magnarelli, Chairman Cooney who want to work with us. The Governor has made it a high priority for herself and her team to work the legislative session to put some teeth into the law there, and hopefully again, reduce the risk. Ultimately, its up to the public to pay attention, and we'll keep up those public service type announcements, and continue to work with our partners the State Police and trucking association to get the word out. So, that concludes my report for this month.

Joanne Mahoney: Anyone have any...

Heather Briccetti Mulligan: I have a question, I don't know if it was Massachusetts or maybe in New Jersey, had a practice on work zones parking a State Police car with the lights on at the beginning of the work zone which gets driver's attention, and I just don't know if that's something that is a possibility, or worth looking into, especially when we have long stretches of big repairs going on, especially with the big capital plan that we've got going.

Frank Hoare: We do that in certain work zones. Again, we have good partnership with the State Police on that, and our other great partners are of course, our unions, teamsters and CSEA on this, and we talk frequently on that. But we do have State Police vehicles that will be out there, again, it's a matter of resources, right in terms of every work zone. As we work hard, typically through the construction season between April and October, we're out there, we're spending a lot of money

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

as Dave reported on as quickly as we can to do the infrastructure repairs. So, there's a lot of miles to cover, but we do do that, and we do do that in certain zones and State Police have been helpful in that and trying to extend that where they can, it's just not every place. And some of our accidents, like the one just two weeks ago, again, it wasn't a work zone. It was Stephen pulled over, looking at something, not sure what at this time, but doing his job, that's what supervisors do, and he pulled over, wasn't a work zone, so you just have a driver again, I'm not sure until the investigation is over, but that raises the question, that type of practice and protocol, we need to change that, right. Do we need to say anytime anybody stops; it's got to be treated as a work zone? So, again, we do work very hard after an accident or an incident, you'll hear about the terrible accidents and tragedies, but we have work zone intrusions, this summer, we have near misses almost every week.

Norman Jones: That was going to be my question. I know when these incidents occur not with just this one, but in my past life, we did a near miss log and every time we had a near miss, we used that as a training opportunity. So, I don't know if that's what you're doing but that might be an opportunity. I know when I studied safety, I know on the oil rigs in the Gulf, they had the worst record ever and this company came in and instituted their near miss log and talked about the incidences where you were very comfortable doing certain things in a very hazardous area. But by utilizing that near miss logs, and guess what, you can't be comfortable doing that. So, I think that can be helpful, I don't know if you've done that in your past life, but that's a tool that I've used in the past and it really helped us reduce certain things. A lot of times when you have the incidents, they occur in places where you feel completely relaxed and at ease.

Frank Hoare: We use every incident to follow up and do a lesson learned on that. and our division directors are very keyed into that, they push that down to supervisors, so yes, we have to continue that.

Norman Jones: It's a powerful tool.

Frank Hoare: Kevin, anything to add to that?

Kevin Wisely: It really is a powerful tool. What's truly important is we have established procedures and practices in place and execute them but as the Executive Director articulated, the roadway has really changed in these recent years. Distractions, people not paying attention, people working on their computers mounted in their cars, so we have to continue to look at and continue to advance events and view those near misses which will occur more often than you would imagine. Mirrors getting ripped off, cones getting knocked down, just it's a hazardous duty.

Norman Jones: When was the last time you had a fatality?

Frank Hoare: 2016.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Frank Hoare: 2016. We went 8 years without a fatality. I know Director Briccetti Mulligan you had asked about numbers. We got together and we would get that to you, I think our record is pretty good, of course, that's pretty good compared to other transportation entities in other states, but that's of no comfort obviously or solace to our families when this happens. But looking at data from other states, looking at incidents also is part of our lessons learned efforts and what are other places doing as you said. What is Massachusetts doing? And so, our folks are looking at that, it's increased now because we have a sense of urgency. We need to get not only talk to public but also to our own people and reassure them and that's our duty and obligation to everyone that works at the Thruway that we're going to do everything possible and leave no stone unturned to provide as safe a work zone as possible. And the old saying in the military, everybody is their own safety officer, right. So, whether you're here 6 months or 3 decades, that's the message we say to people is that you are your own safety officer. If you see something unsafe, you call it out. And we try hard to get that message out.

Paul Tokasz: Just a comment, I spent four hours this morning coming from Buffalo, and went through admittedly there is a lot less work going on on the Thruway in terms of work zones, but there were several and as I was thinking here, I was struck by the number of message boards that we're leading up to that that said in the next 6 miles, some cases, work zone, beware of that and then there was a sign about doubling the fines, and then in some cases, there were troopers at the beginning of the work zone, most of the work was bridges, most of the work was shoulders, I think 2 of the 6 or 7 that I passed through today had troopers at them with the lights this morning coming from Buffalo.

Murray Bodin: Not troopers they're police. There is no such thing as a trooper.

Paul Tokasz: Well, okay State Police were there.

Paul Tokasz: Fine, thank you.

Paul Tokasz: Sorry. So, I just was struck by the amount of activity with those message boards well in advance of the work zone area and would say either something occurring 6 miles from exit 40, and there was, I think it gets people to at least be aware well in advance of what's going on, and I would just encourage it. I know during the heavy construction season, there's lots of work going on, it's more difficult, but I think folks the public who is going to make these decisions, may be sensitized to it a little bit more because of the messaging that's taking place, and I hope more of that continues.

Frank Hoare: No rational person can say they come up on work zone without notice, right. There's protocols and regulations for that in terms of signage and messaging. So, for any work zone that's set up, there's no excuse for that, right. You've got plenty of time to adjust your speed and plenty of warning to slow down and pay attention. Obviously, there are instances where if a car breaks down or there's an issue and happens to happen quickly, but even there we have a tremendous team that work in the operations center that almost instantaneously get the word out, getting

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

messages on those boards, traffic safety folks that get out there and set up so, even in the it's not a planned work zone, there is for the most part lots of messaging out there and lots of warning. We've just gotta get people to pay attention and say that's real.

Jose Holguin Veras: I have a question about a different topic. Have we benchmarked our practices during heavy storms because the sense I get other countries they have they do nothing, and it might be interesting to see basically what we could learn from this practice. Because first safety is goal number 1. Also, if we are going to accomplish our safety goals to get the public that's traveling without delays these basically it is going to be beneficial to the company. And might be interesting to see.

Frank Hoare: Again, we are looking at other places, other practices with bad weather, there are benchmarks that we look at. The amount of snow coming down per hour, the texture of the snow, so there are signs, in bad weather and approaching winter weather, what makes that more complicated is the Thruway is just one element of the transportation system, right? State roads DOT roads in addition to ours you have county roads, town roads, and sometimes they see things differently right, in terms of where they want their traffic to go. But that's what happens in the operation center, that's the communication and sort of whole system and why it comes from the top down, but we're looking other places because...

Jose Holguin Veras: The traffic sign I know exactly we have to obey and all the goals that we have, it might be reducing your speed. There is practice for that.

Frank Hoare: Right, and we have some of that, we certainly again, how much snow is falling, how quickly, winds will have empty tractor-trailer bans because of winds, we will have tractor-trailer bans and when we do that it's because the road is dangerous for them and for passenger vehicles, but the risk is much higher. A tractor-trailer goes off the road or jackknives on a road, that's shutting down the road, that a passenger vehicle may not do, because it's a much more complicated recovery operation for us and for other first responders. So, yes, we have that in place and that's not only us but we partner with the other first responder agencies. We have that and we do just like safety in general, look at what other states are doing, what other countries are doing, we look at Canada very closely because they are our neighbors to the north. When there's an incident, when there's an incident or storm, the operation centers are in touch with the counterparts not only in other states but in Canada right, to coordinate that response.

Joanne Mahoney: Any other discussion? I would say as Chair, on behalf of the Board, we would like to express our condolences to Stephen's family, his wife, his children, and to the Thruway staff more broadly. It is clear that a lot of time and effort has gone into making the roadway as safe as we can, and I imagine it's devastating for people who work here when something like this happens. I'm sorry.

Frank Hoare: Thank you very much.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Joanne Mahoney: Alright, and we now come to the public comment period for general Thruway Authority matters. Individuals who wish to make a public comment may sign up in advance, and there is fifteen-minute time limit for this comment period, and individuals will have up to two minutes to speak. Julie, has anyone signed up to make comments to the Board?

Julie: Yes, Chair, Mr. Bodin is here to today to make an in-person comment.

Joanne Mahoney: Alright, thank you. Murray the floor is yours.

Murray Bodin: My name is Murray Bodin, I have a list here, so I want to read my notes. I'm an environmentalist. This is a picture of my great granddaughter taken 2 weeks ago.

Joanne Mahoney: Congratulations.

Murray Boden: Thank you. I'm concerned with the environment that we leave to her. From what I see going on here today is going to upset you enormously. Yesterday, the MTA had a meeting I've been going to their meetings for years. They have always been committee meetings one after the other, and on Wednesday, there was a Board Meeting. Well, recognition that we have to save a lot of a lot of a lot of, all the meetings were pressed into one. All the meetings were one meeting everybody was there, started at 9:00, I used to have 2 minutes to speak at each meeting, 8 minutes, I had 2 minutes the whole thing. It changed everything, nobody had to come on Wednesday, they set it up once, they went through the committees, everybody heard the same thing at the same time, what a savings in everything. They didn't have to set it up twice, they didn't have to check everybody in twice. Enormous, it never occurred to anybody to do it any differently. Well, it's different. I'll scoot on. Alright, I can try and hit where I fit here. Why do you have plastic bottles here? Virtually everybody else, this has to be made, transported, everybody else had a pitcher that goes around and a paper cup, why don't you have it? Well, this is the way we've done it. Oh boy, I have to do it from memory.

Joanne Mahoney: Do you have it in your notes, do you want me to help you find it, Murray?

Murray Boden: I can't get the date. I'm 91 years old, I have dementia, I have no memory, I met Bob downstairs, he had to tell me who he was. You want me to follow your rules when you don't follow the rules. I came to know Frank well, 6 months ago, 8 months ago, saying the lines on our road are wrong. It's his responsibility to see that the staff are using legal lines. They're not. And if he can't enforce the rules of the manual as it is currently written, you know about it, you probably know about it, you probably, you know about it because you were directly on e-mails asking him to enforce the law as currently written. He didn't. Therefore, you replace him with somebody who's going to follow the law. We have a new president coming in, Governor is not stupid, yesterday the MTA passed congestion pricing. Is it 100% right and will it have bugs in it, absolutely. It's going to be fixed in the future. The Governor reversed and it was passed yesterday, and it will be done. So, the question is, if Frank can't enforce the law about the lines on the side of the road to replacement, this is the responsibility of this Board to see the operation and safety.

NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

And he's not doing it. Your responsibility is to fire him and replace him with somebody who's going to obey the law. You want me to obey the law when you're breaking the law, not going to happen. I'll take as much time as I need to take to get you to understand. I listened about the safety there. You have half the lanes blocked up for half a mile before and after, a waste of time. You've got help trucks out there with a big arrow on the top, I haven't heard any of those help trucks being devastated, and yet the police cars are. They are State Police and when you use the word trooper, it's an oxymoron. Which if you go to the State Police website, it says, New York State Troopers, it doesn't exist. You use the word trooper, there is no such thing. Why does the website then for the New York State Police say New York State Troopers? Your responsibility is to recognize that what I suggested years ago about using safety lines need to be implemented. This has been going on for 30 years. I met Bob downstairs, we met years ago, you go into a service area, the line on the left is yellow, the line on the right is white. Who talked about distracted and aggressive driving, was it you, I think? People have no perception, the light turns green, nobody moves but they're texting. When you look up if you see a yellow line on the left and a white line on the right, you know which way to go. If you see white on both sides, it's confusing. So, why do we do it, because he doesn't obey the law, and you haven't fired him.

Joanne Mahoney: Murray.

Murray Bodin: I'm going to talk as long as I talk, and I don't care. You want to carry me out here, there's a record there, you will all know that's I was stopped from speaking for safety reasons. This is all about safety. You talk about it. Here's a good one, you've got dozens and dozens of snowplows out there, because 50 years ago there were no attenuators and so you put three trucks out there. You want to block two lanes of traffic, you put a truck out there with a snowplow stick that arrow on the ones that are in the help trucks, not the ones that you use, and you have one truck blocking two lanes of traffic, not three. When they use three, it was a different world. You can hire contractors who have trained drivers backing up dump trucks to do their snowplowing. Everyone of those trucks has a GPS on the top of it, you pay them by the mile. The drivers are trained to back those dump trucks up. All you gotta do is put a snowplow on the front, and then you pay them by the mile, and you cut your snowplow trucks in half. I've been told we send those trucks out to put mileage on them, because we want to get new ones. You don't have to like what I'm saying. Somebody, one of you is going to like it. The Governor is going to like it because the Governor said, I want adjustment in pricing, and it's coming. It will be corrected and there will be mistakes. I have dementia, I'm slowing it down, I know it. I have a bad hip, I need a hip replacement. I'm not going to do it because at 91 I'm not taking that chance; I'll kick the bucket first. Resources better used for younger people. I had a list of stuff here, I'll send it to you whether you listen to it or not, your problem. You're all concerned with safety in a safety zone, you put in a double yellow line in the middle and the people don't cross in there, a white line can only mean one thing, it's a right edge line and if you think aggressive drivers are going to understand what it means in a traffic zone, you're crazy. You want them to stay in line you put a double yellow line a double white line in there. I don't care what you say, you can have me, I was stopped by a trooper coming up here today because he said...



NYS Thruway Authority Board Meeting  
November 19, 2024

Jennifer Givner: Sir, the meeting is ready to adjourn. Do you have...

Murray Bodin: That's fine, you can adjourn the meeting right in front of me. These need to be said and if you want to carry me out of here, fine, as long as this gentleman who referred to as troopers, you know what the problem is.

Joanne Mahoney: With all due respect, you just said yourself the troopers. I know it's just colloquial. But we do have to end the meeting, and I'll look for you to e-mail that to us.

Murray Bodin: It's your responsibility as members of this Board to look about safety in the way the world has changed today. You have a new president; he's going to disrupt everything. Why is he going to disrupt it because Frank hasn't fixed it.

Joanne Mahoney: Okay, that concludes the formal agenda for our meeting. And in the materials for today's meeting, you'll see the listed dates for 2025 Board Meetings. Please review and let Julie know if you have any major conflicts. Is there any other business to bring before the Board. May I have a motion to adjourn?

Bob Megna: Second.

Joanne Mahoney: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Joanne Mahoney: The meeting is adjourned. Our next meeting is Wednesday, January 15<sup>th</sup>, 2025, at 1:00 p.m. As we enter snow and ice season, please slow down and be mindful of the snowplows and emergency response vehicles that will be on the road. Have a safe and happy holiday season. Thank you all.