New York State Thruway Authority RFP #18C15

Design, Construction, Financing, Operation and Maintenance of 27 Service Areas on the New York State Thruway

Authority Responses to Written Questions January 31, 2019

On October 15, 2018, the New York State Thruway Authority ("Authority") issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) for Design, Construction, Financing, Operation and Maintenance of 27 Service Areas on the New York State Thruway, which was amended by Addendum No. 1 dated November 8, 2018, Addendum No. 2 dated December 21, 2018, Addendum No. 3 dated December 27, 2018, Addendum No. 4 dated January 25, 2019 and Addendum No. 5 dated January 29, 2019 (the "RFP"). Pursuant to the RFP, all prospective Proposers were given an opportunity to submit written questions concerning this RFP to the Authority by February 28, 2019. Potential Proposers were also given an opportunity to address additional questions at the Pre-Proposal Conference held on November 13, 2018.

The Authority received the following questions and submits the following responses in accordance with Section 1.2 of the RFP.

Q1: Who is responsible for the Sloatsburg walk over bridge?

A1: Currently, the Authority maintains the pedestrian bridge and the current operator for Sloatsburg is responsible for litter and debris removal and disposal on the bridge. The Authority plans to remove the pedestrian bridge sometime in 2020. Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for removal and disposal of litter and debris on the pedestrian bridge until the bridge is removed by the Authority.

Q2: Who is responsible for the maintenance of the Sloatsburg parking structure?

A2: Currently, the Authority maintains the Sloatsburg parking structure and the current operator for Sloatsburg is responsible for removal and disposal of litter and debris at the parking structure. Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for maintaining, repairing and replacing the Sloatsburg parking structure, and the Operator will also be responsible for removal and disposal of litter and debris at the parking structure, in accordance with RFP Exhibit B, Section 6, Operator Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Obligations.

Q3: Is there land to increase parking lots in flagship sites? Who is responsible for reconfigure or layout of parking lots entrances, exits etc?

- A3: The Thruway is part of the Interstate System and as such must comply with federal requirements related to commercial sales. Commercial sales are allowed at the existing 27 Service Areas because they are "grandfathered" in before the prohibition on commercialization took effect. The grandfather allowance applies to the footprint of the existing service area which is the property owned by the Authority. Therefore, acquiring additional, private land would not be considered. However, it may be possible for the Operator to modify the area under the jurisdiction of the Authority to accommodate more parking, provided it also falls within the area for which the Operator has responsibility, as outlined in the Responsibility Maps attached as Exhibit 6 to the RFP. The Operator is responsible for reconfiguration and layout of parking lots/entrances and exits.
- Q4: Can we propose to not teardown the plazas and reconfigure existing building space (add Windows, change entrances) and use them to reduce costs?
- A4: A proposal that contemplates reconfiguration of the Service Areas, rather than tearing them down, will be acceptable, provided that it complies with the requirements of the RFP. Please refer to RFP Section 2.2.1 for the scope of the required services. In particular, paragraph E of Section 2.2.1 establishes the minimum requirements for capital improvements to the Service Areas. The Authority's intent is to encourage innovation and to provide Proposers with the flexibility to determine the optimal approach to providing the required services.
- Q5: Snow plowing who maintains employee lots, back access roads, etc.?
- A5: Currently, the Authority plows snow in the employee lots and in the back access roads that are within the Authority's property. Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for snow and ice removal in employee parking lots and in the back access roads on Authority property as indicated in the Responsibility Maps included in Exhibit 6 to the RFP. Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 6, Operator Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Obligations and RFP Exhibit 6, Service Area Responsibility Maps.
- Q6: Who will be responsible for emergency generators? Will they have the ability to power the entire building?
- A6: Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for maintenance and operation of emergency generators. Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 6, Operator Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Obligations. Currently, only the following Service Areas have generators that power the entire building: Angola, Clarence, Ontario, Scottsville, Pembroke, Indian Castle, Seneca, Clifton Springs and Chittenango. There are no plans to increase the

- number of generators that do this prior to commencement of the term of the Lease Agreement.
- Q7: Who is responsible for sidewalk repairs and maintenance and back dock areas?
- A7: Currently, the Authority is responsible for Service Area sidewalk repairs and maintenance, and the current operator maintains the back dock areas. Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for sidewalk and maintenance repairs and back dock areas. Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 6, Operator Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Obligations and RFP Exhibit 6, Service Area Responsibility Maps.
- Q8: Who will be responsible for guest accidents in parking lots?
- A8: Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 16, Indemnification and RFP Exhibit 6, Service Area Responsibility Maps.
- Q9: Who is responsible for striping, paving, and maintenance of parking lots including potholes and sinkholes?
- A9: Currently, the Authority is responsible for these tasks. Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for striping, paving and maintenance of parking lots, including repairs of potholes and sinkholes, as indicated in the Responsibility Maps included in Exhibit 6 to the RFP. Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 6, Operator Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Obligations and RFP Exhibit 6, Service Area Responsibility Maps.
- Q10: Will we be responsible for maintenance of employee parking lots and access roads?
- A10: Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for maintenance of employee parking lots and access roads on Authority property as indicated in the Responsibility Maps included in Exhibit 6 to the RFP. Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 6, Operator Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Obligations and RFP Exhibit 6, Service Area Responsibility Maps.

- Q11: Roof repairs, exterior doors, glass, handicap doors etc. currently thruway are they all operator responsibilities now?
- A11: Under the Lease Agreement, these will be responsibilities of the Operator. Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 6, Operator Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Obligations, specifically the "Ordinary Maintenance" Section.
- Q12: Who is responsible for managing storm water run-off in parking lots?
- A12: Under the Lease Agreement, the Operator will be responsible for all storm water management associated with construction, operation and maintenance in accordance with all applicable requirements. Please see RFP Section 2.2.1 E, RFP Appendix B, Section 4, Required Improvements, and RFP Appendix E, Environmental Information, for more information.
- Q13: Are size and offering at each plaza a requirement? Can bidders propose alternative offerings or building size?
- A13: Please refer to RFP Section 2.2.1 for the scope of the required services. In particular, paragraph E of Section 2.2.1 establishes the minimum requirements for capital improvements to the Service Areas. The Authority's intent is to encourage innovation and to provide Proposers with the flexibility to determine the optimal approach to providing the required services.
- Q14: Pricing how many different pricing zones will there be that we have to survey?
- A14: The number of pricing survey locations has not been established. It will be proposed by the Operator and be subject to the Authority's approval. Please refer to RFP Appendix B, Section 5, Operation and Management of Service Areas, Food and Beverage Prices, for more information.
- Q15: New future convenience stores operated by the fuel company will impact sales projections. Can you provide which sites will have this option in the future?
- A15: It is not possible to state which locations will have this option, as the Authority will only determine how to address Convenience Stores at the premises leased to the fuel service vendors when the Authority issues an RFP for fuel services in the future. At this time Convenience Stores are located at the following fuel service facilities: Sloatsburg, Plattekill, Ulster, Oneida, Chittenango, Junius Ponds, Clifton Springs, Clarence and Pembroke.

- Q16: What are plans for high speed exits? Currently Gov. M Cuomo Bridge is high speed, Yonkers toll is planned high speed as well as Harriman exit (Route 17/Woodbury area exchange).
- A16: Cashless tolling is now fully operational at all seven of the Thruway's fixed-price toll barriers: Gov. Mario M. Cuomo Bridge (I-87/I-287), North and South Grand Island Bridges (I-190), Harriman Toll Barrier (I-87), Yonkers Toll Barrier (I-87), Spring Valley Toll Barrier (I-87 Commercial Vehicles Only) and New Rochelle (I-95). The rest of the Thruway System is expected to convert to cashless tolling by the end of 2020.
- Q17: When are additional exits converting to high speed/toll (unstaffed) will further impact easy access to off road competition
- A17: Please see answer A16.
- Q18: NYSTA cafeteria is not listed in this opportunity. Will it be a requirement?
- A18: The NYSTA Cafeteria, which is located at Authority Headquarters in Albany, NY, is not a requirement in this RFP, and should not be included in any Proposal.
- Q19: How will wastewater issues, water supply issues be handled by the Thruway to plazas?
- A19: For water/wastewater furnished by municipalities, the Operator will be responsible for maintenance/repair/replacement of the Authority owned lines from the point of connection to the municipality. For water provided by the Authority, the Operator will be responsible for maintenance/repair/replacement of the Authority's water and sprinkler lines from the final connection point where water leaves the Authority's water plant. For wastewater service provided by the Authority. Operator will responsible the be maintenance/repair/replacement of Authority owned sewer lines from the first point of connection to the Authority's wastewater treatment plant.
- Q20: What are requirements for those sites with Truckers lounges showers; separate entries. What are the staffing levels required for those areas.
- A20: Please refer to RFP Section 2.2.1 C.7, in particular the requirement that trucker's lounges have a secured indoor separate entrance. Please also refer to RFP Section 2.2.1 B. for Service Area staffing requirements. Additionally, RFP Appendix B requires a Safety and Security Plan and Operational Plan be submitted for the Authority's approval.

- Q21: Please provide a set of as-built drawings for each of the 27 Service Areas.
- A21: A set of as-built drawings for each of the 27 Service Areas can be found on the Authority's Service Area RFP webpage.

 https://www.thruway.ny.gov/external/service-area-rfp/index.html
- Q22: Please provide a MS Word version of the RFP and an unlocked PDF version (this will facilitate internal reporting, developing future questions to the NYSTA and development of the response to the RFP).
- A22: Such versions of the RFP will not be made available.
- Q23: Please provide a detailed breakdown of the historical financial performance for the 27 Service Areas to the greatest extent available including rent rolls, sales / revenue by specific food service provider and any cost data that the NYSTA may have
- A23: Please see Answer A45 of Authority Responses to Pre-Proposal Conference Questions dated January 23, 2019.
- Q24: Please provide guidance on whether NYSTA has contemplated tax exempt financing for the Project and if so, the status of NYSTA's efforts to enable/support the same.
- A24: Pursuant to RFP Appendix B, Section 2, the Operator is solely responsible for obtaining and repaying all necessary financing. The Authority has no plans to support any Operator financing by providing tax exempt financing for the Project.
- Q25: Would it be possible for you to put me in touch with the appropriate contacts for the other companies you anticipate responding to your RFP?
- A25: It is not possible for the Authority to do this. However, the Authority issued the list of attendees at the Pre-Proposal Conference on November 20, 2018 and the list of parties who responded to the Request for Expressions of Interest on December 21, 2018. Both are available on the Authority's website.

 https://www.thruway.ny.gov/external/service-area-rfp/index.html
- Q26: We are part of a team working on the RFP for the NYS Thruway. Can we please get access to the existing condition drawings for each travel plaza building? PDF and or AutoCAD files?
- A26: Please see Answer A21.

- Q27: Is it the Authority's intention to release written responses to the questions asked orally at the pre-proposal meeting held on November 13, 2018?
- A27: Yes. The Authority issued written responses to the questions asked orally at the pre-proposal conference held on November 13, 2018 on January 23, 2019. Pursuant to Section 1.4 of the RFP, only the written responses to such questions can be relied upon by the Proposers. Oral responses provided by the Authority's representatives at the pre-proposal conference are not binding on the Authority.
- Q28: Please provide 2018 year to date (YTD) Sales by Plaza.
- A28: Restaurant sales data for calendar year 2018, by Service Area, are attached.
- Q29: Please provide 2018 YTD Traffic by Plaza.
- A29: The 2018 Average Annual Daily Traffic (AADT) information is not available at this time. If data for some or all of the Service Areas becomes available before the date that Proposals are due, the Authority will post the data on its website.

 https://www.thruway.ny.gov/external/service-area-rfp/index.html
- Q30: May Proposers bid a tiered rent structure?
- A30: Proposers may not propose a tiered rent structure. Please refer to RFP Section 2.3, Financial Requirements and RFP Appendix B, Section 10, Rent, Utilities and Other Expenses, for more information.
- Q31: Are number of concepts per each level shown in Exhibit 5 a required minimum? For example, Level 2A shows a total of eight concepts (excluding Taste of NY). Would a Proposer be disqualified for proposing fewer concepts?
- A31: There is no required minimum for the number of concepts at the Service Areas. Subject to the requirements specified in Section 2.2.1 G. of the RFP, the prototype designs in RFP Exhibit 5, the Conceptual Plan, are not mandatory or binding on Proposers in any respect, including, but not limited to, the concepts that are listed. Please refer to RFP Section 2.2.1.G for more information about RFP Exhibit 5 and what Proposers must submit.
- Q32: Are food service and retail categories per each level shown in Exhibit 5 mandatory? For example, Level 3 includes a casual dine restaurant. Would Proposers be disqualified for not including a casual dine restaurant (as an example) as part of their bid?
- A32: Please see Answer A31.

2018 RESTAURANT DATA

Service Area																											
Service Area		JAN		FEB		MAR		APR		MAY		JUNE		JULY		AUG		SEPT		ОСТ		NOV		DEC		-	Total
HMSHost																											
Ardsley	\$	205,479	\$	186,711	\$	225,195	\$	249,283	\$	290,555	\$	301,043	\$	302,031	\$	306,966	\$	254,493	\$	271,020	\$	247,979	\$	226,054	\$		3,066,809
Sloatsburg		507,667		508,029		621,952		667,825		778,095		823,336		909,054		956,337		686,891		710,040		696,978		707,420	\$		8,573,624
Plattekill		411,610		445,847		504,355		491,399		593,481		651,323		809,549		888,565		571,962		598,644		546,252		563,156	\$		7,076,143
Ulster		335,113		329,635		359,725		344,512		404,176		429,992		573,071		570,174		402,448		393,415		371,532		383,026	\$		4,896,819
New Baltimore		593,669		640,359		708,191		683,454		814,664		844,791		1,073,600		1,123,679		760,853		747,628		672,829		692,794	\$		9,356,511
Pattersonville		251,074		255,949		333,978		417,131		485,280		541,959		681,339		724,176		470,143		515,871		430,573		371,708	\$,	5,479,181
Indian Castle		160,827		158,237		198,398		225,489		293,379		315,247		403,122		397,157		296,439		289,072		257,913		241,336	\$;	3,236,616
Iroquois		198,430		193,202		241,003		266,694		312,564		351,995		428,085		463,464		315,108		333,504		302,547		273,147	\$;	3,679,743
Oneida		205,131		207,614		266,202		309,568		376,239		421,282		530,038		527,909		370,114		373,465		331,290		292,313	\$		4,211,165
Chittenango		162,935		159,368		198,738		219,195		274,291		308,841		409,744		414,669		285,529		283,840		237,549		217,776	\$;	3,172,475
Junius Ponds		156,291		152,618		197,941		224,751		287,193		317,988		398,330		407,303		272,111		260,642		226,074		220,310	\$;	3,121,552
Clifton Springs		246,462		257,702		327,957		363,629		479,443		521,561		631,991		639,424		455,163		445,557		392,117		373,190	\$		5,134,196
Total Sales	\$ 3	3,434,688	\$ 3	3,495,271	\$ 4	4,183,635	\$ 4	1,462,930	\$		\$	5,829,358	\$	7,149,954	\$	7,419,823	\$	5,141,254	\$	5,222,698	\$ 4	,713,633	\$ 4	4,562,230	\$		1,004,834
		, ,		, ,		, ,	•	, ,		, ,	•	, ,		, ,				, ,	•	, ,	•	, ,	<u> </u>				, ,
Total Revenue	\$	409,888	\$	416,976	\$	499,072	\$	532,333	\$	642,979	\$	695,639	\$	857,995	\$	893,431	\$	667,342	\$	623,516	\$	562,884	\$	544,469	\$		7,346,524
		•		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				*		,		·		•		·		·	·			•		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Delaware North																											
Seneca	\$	121,486	\$	120,595	\$	163,993	\$	171,468	\$	227,403	\$	266,563	\$	357,447	\$	361,279	\$	244,857	\$	231,795	\$	182,726	\$	173,260	\$		2,622,872
Scottsville		137,233		133,311		182,296	·	204,705	·	273,873	·	316,971		408,731	·	417,760	·	284,905		261,471	•	210,176	·	202,485	\$		3,033,917
Pembroke		222,955		219,532		295,832		331,590		419,438		481,455		623,534		640,930		428,931		403,551		327,705		329,901	\$		4,725,354
Clarence		142,294		139,453		179,454		197,749		250,868		278,008		354,254		346,724		257,402		252,416		202,518		196,127	\$		2,797,267
Total Sales	\$	623,968	\$	612,891	\$	821,575	\$	905,512	\$		\$	1,342,997	\$	1,743,966	\$	1,766,693	\$	1,216,095	\$	1,149,233	\$	923,125	\$	901,773	\$		3,179,410
	Ť	,		,						1,111,000		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		1,1 10,000		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		1,=10,000	<u> </u>	-,,		,	Ť				-, ,
Total Revenue	\$	81,116	\$	79,676	\$	106,805	\$	117,717	\$	152,306	\$	174,590	\$	228,346	\$	265,004	\$	182,414	\$	149,400	\$	120,006	\$	117,231	\$		1,774,611
1		0.1,1.10		,		,	<u> </u>	,		,		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,					т	,,,,,	<u> </u>	,		.==,					.,,
McDonald's																											
Ramapo	\$	285,764	\$	294,032	\$	338,246	\$	338,609	\$	431,085	\$	441,319	\$	599,436	\$	598,669	\$	431,956	\$	432,778	\$	376,582	\$	304,877	\$		4,873,353
Modena		382,421		380,643		408,514		389,065		468,506		495,959		691,819		693,028		482,421		472,644		419,380		267,355	\$,	5,551,755
Malden		315,053		343,518		373,000		364,273		448,219		490,524		619,006		692,619		421,423		412,132		383,490		228,588	\$		5,091,845
Guilderland		130,308		131,863		159,519		181,614		217,360		233,473		290,754		287,730		210,323		200,259		184,284		127,330	\$		2,354,817
Mohawk		131,237		131,711		166,528		190,567		244,678		259,606		333,395		343,805		233,167		225,861		202,926		144,495	\$		2,607,976
Schuyler		94,448		92,461		118,871		135,809		163,118		188,193		240,826		246,063		156,735		158,937		136,788		100,369	\$		1,832,618
DeWitt		106,143		108,748		136,804		152,574		188,546		225,383		275,289		283,536		194,887		181,917		157,131		110,272	\$		2,121,230
Warners		230,404		223,344		297,994		334,715		406,805		455,824		584,336		606,560		400,683		366,470		317,677		201,260	\$		4,426,072
Port Byron		154,117		166,566		210,970		248,666		338,671		372,174		477,462		493,747		321,415		297,878		257,675		178,958	φ		3,518,299
Ontario		140,627		137,261		186,272		206,176		283,410		317,690		398,337		398,158		275,728		257,857		209,663		119,934	φ		2,931,113
Angola		376,697		383,426		591,273		610,586		782,436		998,735		1,241,895		1,134,710		783,861		743,010		614,737		217,687	φ Φ		8,479,053
~	¢ ′	2,347,219	Φ,		• •	2,987,991	ዕ ′		Ф		¢		¢		Φ		æ		•	3,749,743	¢ o	3,260,333	¢.		<u>φ</u>		3,788,131
Total Sales	Φ 4	<u>2,347,219</u>	Þ 4	2,393,573	Φ4	2,907,991	φ.	3,152,654	\$	3,912,834	Ф	4,478,880	\$	5,752,555	\$	5,778,625	\$	3,912,599	\$	3,149,143	φЗ	,,200,333	Φ 4	2,001,125	\$	4	J,100,131
Total Revenue	\$	140,833	\$	143,614	\$	179,279	\$	189,159	\$	238,370	\$	268,733	\$	345,153	\$	347,513	\$	233,961	\$	224,189	\$	197,210	\$	176,559	\$		2,684,573
Total Calaa	e /	2 405 075	Φ.	6 FO1 72F	φ.	7 002 204	ተ	E24 000	Φ.	10 522 770	ф <i>4</i>	1 651 005	Φ.	14 646 475	e	14 065 444	ф	10.260.040	ф 4	0 404 674	6.0	007.004	Ф.	7 465 400	Φ	11	7 072 275
Total Sales	ф (0,405,875	\$ (0,501,735	Ф.	<i>r</i> ,993,201	\$ (0,021,096		10,533,776	\$ 1	1,051,235	Ф	14,040,475	Ф	14,905,141	\$	10,269,948	φl	u, 1∠1,6/4	φö	0,097,091	Ф	7,465,128	<u> </u>	11	7,972,375
Total Revenue	\$	631,837	\$	640,266	\$	785,156	\$	839,209	\$	1,033,655	\$	1,138,962	\$	1,431,494	\$	1,505,948	\$	1,083,717	\$	997,105	\$	880,100	\$	838,259	\$	1	1,805,708